

The Life of The First Pentecostal Missionary To China

Jackson Tsui

Research Associate, Xavier Centre for Memory and Identity,

University of Saint Joseph, Macao

Abstract

This article chronologically compiles the life and work of T. J. McIntosh. A legendary figure, T.J. McIntosh was the first Protestant Pentecostal missionary sent by the Pentecostal Holiness Church of the USA to China and arrived in Macau by faith on August 7th, 1907. McIntosh had followed the voice within him which he believed to be from the Holy Spirit and bravely voyaged around the world twice with his family, without any solid financial support. He pioneered missional effort in Macau, Hong Kong, and Sainam. As the first Pentecostal missionary to China. McIntosh did not stay in China long enough to see the fruit of his work. Yet his efforts and impact has been taken up and continued by both other missionaries and local Chinese believers.

INTRODUCTIONS

Protestantism was planted in China by Robert Morrison who landed in Macau on September 4th, 1807. His arrival in Macau is not just related to the history of Protestantism in Macau, but also marked the birth of the Chinese Protestant Christianity worldwide. The Anglican priest-in-charge of the Morrison Chapel in Macau, Stephen Durie, expressed this in 2015: “Every Chinese protestant church all over the world is indebted to Macau, they just do not know about it.”¹ Yet, there were different groups of missionaries that followed the footstep of Morrison to China, and Pentecostal missionaries also began their China mission in Macau.

The Pentecostal movement emerging in the early 1900s differed significantly from other, older mainline churches in Europe and North America, specifically in their eschatological outlooks and missionary approaches. Pentecostal historian Cecil M. Robeck points out that the Charles Parham Doctrine of evidential tongues meant that people “were being specially equipped to carry out God’s end-time global missionary mandate.”² And during the Azusa Street Revival, William Seymour and his team sent many missionaries to places that matched the dialect they were believed to have received from their Spirit Baptism and expressed in their evidential tongues or glossolalia. Although the Azusa Street Mission did not send out the first ever Pentecostal missionary to China, Robeck observed that, “Chinese” was among the favorite languages “identified” by those who frequented Azusa Street.”³ In terms of the origin of Pentecostals in China, J. Gordon Melton and many other scholars recognize that the first Pentecostal missionary to China was Thomas James (T. J.) McIntosh.⁴

1. EARLY LIFE AND EXPERIENCE OF THE HOLY SPIRIT

T. J. McIntosh is a legendary character as the first Pentecostal missionary sent to China by the Pentecostal Holiness Church of the USA, landing in Macau by faith on August 7th, 1907.⁵ He was born in Sumter County, South Carolina, on May 15, 1879. On July 5th, 1902, McIntosh married Annie Elizabeth Edens.⁶ Annie’s sister, Sarah Edens (Mrs. F. M. Britton), was also a Pentecostal Holiness Church minister who married Francis M. (F. M.) Britton, a future Pentecostal Holiness leader after McIntosh. Annie and

¹ Durie, Stephen, “210th anniversary of Morrison arrival to China: Glorified Voyage Mission Conference” (September 15, 2017).

² Cecil M. Robeck, *The Azusa Street Mission and Revival* (Nashville, TN: Thomas Nelson, 2006), 236.

³ Robeck, *Azusa Street Mission*, 237

⁴ J. Gordon Melton, “Pentecostalism Comes to China: Laying the Foundations for a Chinese Version of Christianity,” in *Global Chinese Pentecostal and Charismatic Christianity*, ed. Fenggang Yang, Joy K.C. Tong, and Allan Anderson, *Global Pentecostal and Charismatic Studies* (Leiden: Brill, 2017), 45; Daniel Glenn Woods, “Failure and Success in the Ministry of T. J. McIntosh, the First Pentecostal Missionary to China,” *Cyberjournal for Pentecostal-Charismatic Research*, 2003, accessed October 22, 2019, <http://www.pctii.org/cyberj/cyberj12/woods.html>; R. G. Tiedemann, “The Origins and Organizational Developments of the Pentecostal Missionary Enterprise in China” 1 (2011): 108–46; Daniel H Bays, “The Protestant Missionary Establishment and Pentecostal Movement,” in *Pentecostal Currents in American Protestantism*, ed. E. L. Blumhofer et al. (Chicago: University of Illinois Press, 1999), 50–67; Anderson, *To the Ends*, 65; Harold D. Hunter, “Take a Note,” *Legacy*, no. 8 (2001).

⁵ Bays, “Protestant Missionary Establishment,” 52; Hunter, *Take a Note*.

⁶ Sarah Britton, “In Memoriam,” *The Pentecostal Holiness Advocate*, June 4, 1953, 14

Sarah had an aunt, named Anne Kirby, who later joined McIntosh on his missionary journey.⁷ In 1906, at the age of 27, T. J. McIntosh had already been admitted as a minister of the Holiness Church of the North Carolina Convention.⁸

McIntosh and his wife experienced baptism in the Holy Spirit and speaking in tongues at G. B. Cashwell's first meeting in Dunn, a small city in North Carolina on December 31, 1906.⁹ As Florence Goff, Rev. H. H. Goff's wife recalled how she experienced the Dunn meeting with McIntosh present, "Then she (Sister McLaughlin) began to sing a heavenly song in other tongues, a new sound to me. About that time Bro. McIntosh arose and began talking in tongues."¹⁰ After McIntosh's Pentecostal experience, he received a special vision from the Holy Spirit, and he believed that he got a message from God telling him that he needed to go to a place call "Makeo", which he did not even know to exist before that event. There were people opposing and mocking McIntosh as being rather mistaken and confused. Later, he was helped by his friend to find Macau on a map of China, and he started to realize, that this place indeed was exactly where God calls him to go and serve.¹¹

2. ARRIVAL IN MACAU

Without the support of any mission board or sending agency, but with adventuresome and enthusiastic passion about the call from God and inspired by the new wave of revival, on August 7th, 1907, McIntosh, with his wife Annie and their infant daughter Hazel arrived in Hong Kong by ship, from San Francisco. They immediately transited to Macau by boat, and McIntosh became the first Pentecostal missionary to set foot in Macau with his family.¹² McIntosh's arrival was expected and initially welcomed by Macau foreign missionaries who were longing for some first-hand information related to the Azusa Street revival and the subsequent outpouring of the Holy Spirit all over the United States. McIntosh's first meeting in Macau took place in the evening of his arrival day. He attracted twenty-five missionaries, who were vacationing on the seaside during summertime, as well as five to six Chinese believers. Preaching from Luke chapter 24 in a small room equipped with an altar, he soon had all twenty-five missionaries on their knees.¹³ The names of the attendants at McIntosh's first ever meeting on the night of his arrival on August 7th, 1907, were missing. Yet, Daniel H. Bays, historian of the Chinese Protestant Church, assessed that only three missionaries out of the twenty-five accepted McIntosh's teaching.¹⁴ Frank Porter Hamill and Rosa Alice Edwards (Smith), who were Christian and Missionary Alliance missionaries, were two of the twenty-five missionaries who attended McIntosh's meeting and accepted his teaching.¹⁵ Another missionary who joined the meeting and accepted the message was Fannie Winn, a close associate of S. C.

⁷ Anne Kirby, "Letter from China," *Bridegroom's Messenger*, May 15, 1908, 1.

⁸ Holiness Church of North Carolina, Proceedings of the Eighth Annual Convention of Holiness Church of North Carolina (LaGrange, NC: Nash Bros., 1907), 15.

⁹ A. J. Tomlinson, *Diary of A.J. Tomlinson 1901-1923 Vol. 1*, ed. Homer A. Tomlinson (New York: The Church of God, World Headquarters, 1949), 76.

¹⁰ Florence Goff, *Tests and Triumphs* (Falcon, NC: Standard Printing, 1924), 51.

¹¹ George M. Kelley, "The Great Door of Opportunity," *The Latter Rain Evangel* 16, no. 8 (1924): 7-10.

¹² Thomas J McIntosh, "Bro. McIntoshi's Letter," *BM*, October 1, 1907.

¹³ McIntosh, "Bro. McIntoshi's Letter."

¹⁴ Bays, "Protestant Missionary Establishment," 57.

¹⁵ Ethel F. Landies, "Pentecost in South China," *Bridegroom's Messenger*, March 1, 1908, 2.

Todd from the Bible Society. Fannie acted as McIntosh's interpreter as he found that his "Chinese" was not understood by the local people and she would later leave the Bible Society and join McIntosh.¹⁶ Possibly with Fannie's help, McIntosh credited "Brother Todd's mission sent us some bedsteads, chairs, tables, etc., so we did not have much to buy."¹⁷ After McIntosh's arrival meetings, two to three missionaries were baptized by the Holy Spirit, and in later meetings, some Chinese girls received the Holy Spirit, which was accompanied with speaking in tongues. McIntosh rented a house in Macau, where he hosted meetings every day. Meetings would run from the morning until sometimes to 1 AM,¹⁸ and this pattern went on for about three weeks.¹⁹

When McIntosh first arrived in Macau, he did not reach a lot of local Chinese in his meetings. However, the few Macau Chinese who had attended, after receiving the Baptism of the Holy Spirit, became an important part of the future development of the Pentecostal church. In McIntosh's second letter, dated August 22nd, 1907, and sent from Macau to *Bridegroom's Messenger*, he mentioned an event where, "One wealthy Chinaman gave me 15 dollars the other day and since then he has given me a watch and an organ. He invited us to his home in Canton, China. I guess we will go for a few days."²⁰ This wealthy "Chinaman" would be the person to help McIntosh to move the ministry to Canton in the future.²¹

2.1 TONGUES AND RESISTANCE

When McIntosh arrived in Macau, he expected himself to be able to speak Chinese just like when he was exercising the gift of tongues. When he arrived in Macau, he tried to use his tongue to speak to an Indian man, Cassim Musso. McIntosh later claimed that the man was able to have "understood some sentences". He said, "I preached about the Creation of the World."²² Yet, that was a one-time event that happened to a non-Chinese speaking person. In fact, McIntosh was never able to master Chinese to preach but relied on an interpreter for his preaching. In the same letter, McIntosh admitted that, "I have not come in contact with anybody that is able to preach to natives in their own tongue, so that they could understand; I mean [to] preach to them as I could preach in English."²³ The Macau Baptist missionary S. C. Todd was one of his major opponents in Macau, China, and also internationally, due to the fact that Todd wrote several articles for various publications against the teaching of McIntosh. As Todd begins his

¹⁶ Fannie Winn, "How God Has Blessed the Work of Our Missionaries in China," *Bridegroom's Messenger*, June 15, 1908, 2

¹⁷ Thomas J McIntosh, "Macao, China, August 22, 1907." *Bridegroom's Messenger*, October 1, 1907, 4.

¹⁸ McIntosh, "Macao, China, August."

¹⁹ Samuel C. Todd, "An Open Letter: Bring a Calm Review of the Speaking in Tongues in South China," n.d., BatchPMU Box 1, Folder 1, Folder on Sunderland and Alexander Boddy 1905-1928, Donald Gee Research Centre, Donald Gee Research Centre Archive.

²⁰ McIntosh, "Macao, China, August."

²¹ A. E. Kirby, "A Baptized Chinaman," *The Apostolic Faith*, vol. 2, no. 14, June, 1908, 1.

²² JP McIntosh, "A Letter from Macao in South China Runs Thus," *Confidence* (Sunderland, May 1908), 1. This is from a special supplement dated May 1908. Although the author of this letter to A. A. Boddy was printed with the name JP McIntosh, evidently by the timing, the content, and the location of letter, the letter was clearly written by T. J. McIntosh.

²³ McIntosh, "A Letter from Macao."

attack on Pentecostalism in China, especially targeting McIntosh, others back in the USA quoted his articles to join in the attack.

Despite the strong opposition of local missionaries, around Christmas of 1907, Mrs. McIntosh summarized her account of the missionary efforts in Macau. Her letter dated December 28, 1907, was published on February 15, 1908. That seems like the time needed for a letter from Macau to arrive and be published in the U. S. A. The time needed for McIntosh's November letter to be published took about the same duration of time. Mrs. McIntosh mention in her letter how the Spirit spoke to her about feeding the poor and how she responded by preparing free meals for over 135 local Macau beggars at her home.²⁴ It seems, this is the only known published letter by T. J. McIntosh's wife, Annie E. McIntosh. In the whole letter, T. J. McIntosh was not mentioned at all, yet it contains a hint of Fannie Winn's presence in regard of helping her out in this charitable outreach kitchen. There is no indication or evidence that T. J. McIntosh himself was present or not, but this letter shows that his wife, Annie was wholeheartedly doing missional work to support her husband and being a missionary herself. On the other hand, a letter dated January 19th, 1908 by Alfred G. Garr indicates that McIntosh resided in Hong Kong during that time and that he was there often.²⁵

2.2. CONNECTION WITH HONG KONG

As the McIntosh's limitations for expanding the Pentecostal message continued to increase in Macau, he started to turn his focus to the nearby city of Hong Kong. A letter published in April 1908, that was possibly written sometime in February, is reflecting that the local missionaries stopped letting McIntosh use their facilities because they disagreed with the Pentecostal teaching, and "they [the local missionaries] preach to the Chinese that we are wrong. They say to them and to the others that we are under a delusion."²⁶ Due to the lack of support experienced in Macau, and the Garrs were serving in Hong Kong, McIntosh shifted his focus and missionary engagement to the Hong Kong Pentecostal mission work. In the same letter, McIntosh mentions about the situation in Macau as well as events occurring in Hong Kong, especially a dream relating to a Chinese Pentecostal newspaper. McIntosh wrote, "Some time ago, God put it into my heart to get out a paper in the Chinese language for the dear Chinese...He [God] also gave us a Holy Ghost filled Chinese brother to do the printing. God gave me the name of the paper, it is 'Pentecostal Truth.'" The Chinese brother that McIntosh mentioned is Mr. Mok Lai Chi 莫禮智, the founder of the Pentecostal Mission in Hong Kong, who then became the interpreter for both McIntosh and Garr in Hong Kong. McIntosh dreamed about a periodical in Chinese and shared this with Mok, which who later influenced Mok in view of publishing *Pentecostal Truth* 五旬節真理報, the first Chinese Pentecostal newspaper.²⁷ In January 1908, Mok began publishing the *Pentecostal Truth* in Chinese, mainly translating Pentecostal English articles into Chinese in view of spreading the Pentecostal faith. By January 1909, the newspaper was published half in English. The first issue of the half-page English had

²⁴ Annie E. McIntosh, "Letter from China," *Bridegroom's Messenger*, February 15, 1908, 1.

²⁵ Alfred G. Garr, "Letter from Brother Garr," *Bridegroom's Messenger*, March 1, 1908, 4.

²⁶ Thomas J. McIntosh, "Letter from Brother McIntosh," *Bridegroom's Messenger*, April 1, 1908, 1.

²⁷ Lai Chi Mok, "Testimony of Mok Lai Chi," *Confidence II*, no. 12 (1909): 282–84.

two main points: 1. The picture titled “Bro. McIntosh Vision”, a painting that shows a dove with a copy of *Pentecostal Truth* in its mouth, expressing that the publication of the newspaper originated from the vision of T. J. McIntosh; 2. The testimony of Garr, indicating that Garr spoke in Hong Kong in January 1908, and the content relates to his baptism by the Holy Spirit and his mission to India.²⁸ The English supplementary page appeared for the first time, expressing the close relationship between the newspaper and the two missionaries. *Pentecostal Truth* became a medium for contacting and inspiring Pentecostal groups and leaders in the West. By May 1908, the Azusa Street Mission acknowledged that *Pentecostal Truth* was part of the Pentecostal movement by posting McIntosh’s letter requesting financial support for the new publication.²⁹ The former Macau missionary Fannie Winn’s account is coherent with the fact that *Pentecostal Truths* had been published among the Chinese and by her knowledge, “The paper has already reached England, America, Australia, India, Japan and C[K]orea.”³⁰ McIntosh presented this idea at the North Carolina Convention and this gathering supported him by offering “\$12.75, as well as one Testament and one Bible were given for its circulation,” after sharing his vision of a Chinese Pentecostal publication.³¹ Other than providing the dream or the idea of the newspaper *Pentecostal Truth*, there is no evidence showing that McIntosh was directly involved in the publications process or editorial work for this periodical. Yet there is evidence indicating that McIntosh wrote material for the first issue of *Pentecostal Truth*. In the June 1908 issue of *Bridegroom’s Messenger*, McIntosh wrote a letter dated April 5th, 1908, in Macau, which could be the last he wrote before he and his whole family departed for Jerusalem.³²

2.3. CALLING TO GO TO JERUSALEM

In April 1908, McIntosh with his wife Annie and daughter Hazel departed Macau for McIntosh’s next place of calling. They arrived in the Holy City, Jerusalem, on May 16th, 1908, the day after his 29th birthday.³³ When the McIntosh family finally arrived in Jerusalem, they had only 70 cents left with them. They needed to stay in a hotel for two days at the cost of \$10, money they did not have.³⁴ The following Sunday, McIntosh found the local missionary Sister Letherman, who would assist greatly the McIntosh family to get settled in Jerusalem and tour the Holy City. In the process, McIntosh once again felt that the gift of tongues was in fact a real language, “I was in the garden of Gethsemane, where the Holy Spirit spoke with my tongue to a priest, and he threw his arms around me, laughed and patted me on the shoulder, and repeated the same words that the Spirit spoke with my tongue.”³⁵ With the Macau and China experience, McIntosh realized that this tongue experience would only be occasional occurrences, which was not a normal practice or the evidence that he had already acquired the Hebrew language. There

²⁸ Lai Chi Mok, “Bro. T. J. McIntosh Vision,” *Pentecostal Truths* 2, no. 13 (1909): 4.

²⁹ Thomas J. McIntosh, “Chinese Pentecostal Paper,” *The Apostolic Faith* (Los Angeles, California) 2, no. 13 (May 1908): 2.

³⁰ Winn, “How God Has Blessed.”

³¹ Holiness Church of North Carolina, Proceedings of the Ninth Annual Convention of the Holiness Church of North Carolina (Dunn, 1908), 7.

³² T. J. McIntosh, “Letter from Brother McIntosh,” *Bridegroom’s Messenger*, June 1, 1908, 1.

³³ T. J. McIntosh, “Brother McIntosh in Jerusalem – God’s Wonderful Leading,” *Bridegroom’s Messenger*, July 1, 1908, 1.

³⁴ McIntosh, “Brother McIntosh in Jerusalem.”

³⁵ McIntosh, “Brother McIntosh in Jerusalem.”

are no records indicating whether or how McIntosh conducted ministries in Jerusalem. The July 15, 1908 issue of the *Bridegroom's Messenger* was still showing McIntosh residing in Jerusalem.³⁶ But the August 1, 1908 issue of *Bridegroom's Messenger*, shows that McIntosh had moved back to the USA.³⁷ Sometime before September 1908, McIntosh wrote to the Azusa Street Mission to let them know that he was returning back to the USA from Jerusalem and was planning to travel back to China later again.³⁸ In the September 15, 1908 issue of *Bridegroom's Messenger*, R. E. Massey mentions the annual Falcon Camp Meeting that he and his wife attended. In this meeting, the McIntoshs were sharing their missionary experience in China and the promotion of the needs in the mission field.³⁹ Although Massey did not provide any date either on the Falcon Camp Meeting, or a date of his letter, the 1908 annual conference of the Holiness Church of North Carolina showed on their financial reports that an offering was collected on August 20, 1908, "Camp meeting collection, Falcon 13.60."⁴⁰ Therefore, by mid-August 1908, McIntosh had already moved back to the USA

3. RETURN TO THE USA

When McIntosh returned with his family to the USA, he immediately began sharing his mission experience and the need for evangelization to fill China with the Pentecostal spirit. In September 1908, McIntosh was already conducting meetings near Boaz, Alabama, and encouraging others to go as missionaries to Jerusalem.⁴¹ During McIntosh's time in the USA, he was invited to various meetings and conferences to report about his personal mission experience in China. Through these meetings, he was gaining wider popularity, which inspired in him the idea to write a small booklet in the hope of financing his next mission trip. The booklet was entitled *The Life and Work of T. J. McIntosh and Wife and Little Girl: Around the World by Faith*.⁴² In this book, his daughter Hazel would be the mentioned "Little Girl". In April 1908, the book was completed but also the needed funding to be printed and was to be sold at the price of 25 cents per copy.⁴³ In August 1909, McIntosh was hoping that he could depart for his second mission trip by September. The book was already with the printers and it was going to be ready on time for sale at the annual Falcon Camp Meeting, which was held between August 19th to 26th.⁴⁴ The book was first being promoted in *Bridegroom's Messenger* in August 1909, and thereafter listed for sale at 25 cents until November 1911.⁴⁵ There are no records of how much McIntosh raised for the book sale, and as of this day, no scholar has been reported to get hold of a copy of the book.

³⁶ "Corresponding Editors," *Bridegroom's Messenger*, July 15, 1908, 2.

³⁷ "Corresponding Editors," *Bridegroom's Messenger*, August 1, 1908, 2.

³⁸ "Brother McIntosh writes," *The Apostolic Faith*, vol. 11, no. 16, September (1908): 2.

³⁹ R. E. Massey, "Columbia, S. C.," *Bridegroom's Messenger*, September 15, 1908, 2.

⁴⁰ Holiness Church of North Carolina, *Ninth Annual Convention*, 7.

⁴¹ Mrs. Etta C. Pilling, "A Testimony and a Call," *Bridegroom's Messenger*, April 15, 1909, 3.

⁴² "The Life and Trip of T. J. McIntosh and Wife and Little Girl: Around the World by Faith," *The Apostolic Evangel* 1, no. 13 (1909): 4.

⁴³ Untitled notice, *Bridegroom's Messenger*, April 1, 1909, 2.

⁴⁴ "The Life and Work."

⁴⁵ "Some Good Tracts," *Bridegroom's Messenger*, November 15, 1911, 2.

4. SECOND VOYAGE TO CHINA

In November 1909, McIntosh determined to travel again to China on his second mission trip.⁴⁶ After the McIntosh family arrived in Hong Kong, he and his wife started ministering to the Hong Kong Chinese people and taking up Garr's previous works and responsibilities as a foreign Pentecostal missionary. The McIntosh couple gave good reports on how the transition went smoothly after Garr left for India, and that the power of the Holy Spirit manifested himself among them during meetings and prayer sessions.⁴⁷ One major improvement related to McIntosh's team was that they were now learning the local Chinese language at this point, "Now there are altogether eleven of us missionaries in the Home, eight of whom are studying the language and getting on well. Some can already give their testimonies in Chinese."⁴⁸ This shows that they were advancing in their missional strategies as well as an adapted and enhanced understanding of their evidential tongue doctrine. With the help of Mok, the local Chinese faithful, in providing communities services and answering to needs of the local people, became one of their main missionary approaches. "Pentecostal English School for Chinese women and girls and Kindergarten for young children which will be opened on the 18th instant, is in our present premises."⁴⁹ Although things appeared to be advancing, some conflicts within the team started to emerge.

A letter by Mok, dated July 1st, 1910, shows that the conflict between Mok and the missionaries, possibly pointing to McIntosh were incandescent, "As to my coming to America, I hasten to inform you that I am not coming this year...At present, I am on fighting ground the enemy is generally fighting us from within. I must stand by the 'little flock' and drive away wolves who have some and more are coming this way."⁵⁰ Mok was complaining that the teaching of the missionaries in Hong Kong during that time were not from the same doctrine, as he has learned it from Garr and as taught in the *Bridegroom's Messenger*. Mok listed some questionable doctrines, like the annihilation of souls, no "hellism", the Holy Spirit coming before Pentecost, and one step sanctification. As Mok described it, the doctrines taught by missionaries were incoherent among themselves and some even on the borderline of being heretic. McIntosh, as the person in-charge of the missionary "Home", should have been the focal point of the conflict with Mok. In a letter, dated July 30th, 1910, Mok was pleading whether someone can come to oversee the work in Hong Kong, so that he can travel to inland China to preach the Pentecostal message there.⁵¹ Even with all these conflicts and questions from Mok, there were no letter or post from McIntosh, only Lillian Garr in India mentioned, or complained about McIntosh writing a letter to them, stating, "Expect to take charge of the Missionary Home, as we left Brother and Sister McIntosh in charge, but they write they are thinking of going on."⁵²

⁴⁶ "Will Soon Leave for China," *Bridegroom's Messenger*, November 15, 1909, 3.

⁴⁷ Thomas J. McIntosh, "Brother M'Intosh's Letter," *Bridegroom's Messenger*, April 1, 1910, 1; A. McIntosh, "From Sister McIntosh."

⁴⁸ A. McIntosh, "From Sister McIntosh."

⁴⁹ Lai Chi Mok, "From Hong Kong China," *Bridegroom's Messenger*, June 1, 1910, 1.

⁵⁰ Lai Chi Mok, "From Our Chinese Brother," *Bridegroom's Messenger*, September 1, 1910, 4.

⁵¹ Lai Chi Mok, "Hong Kong Pentecostal Mission," *Bridegroom's Messenger*, September 15, 1910, 3.

⁵² Lillian Garr, "From Sister Garr," *Bridegroom's Messenger*, November 1, 1910.1.

Even when the relationship between the Chinese believers and the foreign missionaries in Hong Kong was seemingly falling apart, all hopes were eyed on the arrival of Joseph. H. (J. H.) King from the USA in October 1910. King's background was very similar to that of McIntosh. King was from South Carolina, and served in the Methodist church, before he ministered as the general overseer of the Fire-Baptized Holiness Church, and functioned as the general superintendent of the Pentecostal Holiness Church from 1917 to 1946 in USA.⁵³ Finally on the 18th of October 1910, J. H. King arrived in Hong Kong with a team of missionaries coming from America, including "Brother and Sister Kelly, Brother Davis, Brother Falconer, Mrs. Harrison and daughter, and Miss Gain," and on the next day, a team of eight missionaries from Europe also arrived in Hong Kong, "Sent out by the British Pentecostal Missionary Union for North China and Tibet. We had a blessed meeting on the evening of the 19th."⁵⁴

Mrs. McIntosh reports, dated on November 12th, 1910, in *Upper Room*, that J. H. King conducted a very fruitful meeting in Hong Kong and the group were planning to go to China by following week.⁵⁵ At the same event, but with a different point of view taken by Mok, "Brother McIntosh was most of the time away to Sai Nam [西南], a place in the interior of China beyond Canton, where he has opened a station for his Church, 'The Pentecostal Holiness Church' of North Carolina, U. S. A."⁵⁶ Clearly, in Mok's mind, the new church development by McIntosh in Sainam [西南] was not part of the Hong Kong ministry, and it was only "his Church". For this issue of Mok mentioning McIntosh would be the last occasion in which McIntosh and Cashwell have been listed as corresponding editors. After J. H. King's arrival in Hong Kong, the group went to Sainam to see McIntosh's new development and J. H. King wrote a full-page article related to his trip to China entitled, "A Most Gracious Visitation." Unfortunately, only half of the page of this article has survived in the archives, but still contains some valuable data, "The last instance I mention is the one that occurred at Sai Nam, China, December 6, 1910. We have finished the morning meal and knelt to pray. Sisters McIntosh, Law and I were the only ones in the room, except Hazel McIntosh."⁵⁷ This provides a date that this group of missionaries were in Sainam and at least May Law and the McIntosh's family were present.

4.1.MCINTOSH IN SAINAM 西南, CHINA

Right before J. H. King's arrival in Hong Kong, McIntosh wrote an important letter, dated October 7th, 1910, to *Upper Room* to clarify his situation. In this letter, McIntosh shared his heart about going to inland China and he has already visited and planned to move the missionary headquarter to a place called Sainam 西南. McIntosh pointed out that the advantages of moving the Mission headquarter to Sainam were twofold. The first advantage of moving was economical, and he saw the possibility to reach even more Chinese people with the Pentecostal message. By McIntosh description, "Sai-nam 27

⁵³ David A. Alexander, "Bishop J. H. King and the Emergence of Holiness Pentecostalism," *Pneuma* 8, no. 2 (1986): 159–83.

⁵⁴ Lai Chi Mok, "From China," *Bridegroom's Messenger*, December 1, 1910, 4.

⁵⁵ Mrs. McIntosh, "From Sister McIntosh," *The Upper Room*, January 1, 1911, 7.

⁵⁶ Lai Chi Mok, "Letter From Our Chinese Co-Workers," *Bridegroom's Messenger*, February 1, 1911, 2.

⁵⁷ J. H. King, "A Most Gracious Visitation," *The Apostolic Evangel*, February 1, 1911, 5.

miles out from Canton on the railroad, that has a population of 100,000 and has not a foreign resident or a foreign missionary in it...a million people can be reached with a radius of five miles.”⁵⁸ Today, Sainam’s official name is Xinan Street 西南街道, which is a subdistrict of the Sanshui 三水 within Foshan city 佛山市, inside Guangdong Province 廣東省.⁵⁹ By November 22nd, 1910, McIntosh has already notified the Pentecostal Holiness Church of North Carolina, U. S. A., that he has moved there and is listed under the location Sai Nam, China.⁶⁰ By February, the move to Sainam was officially announced to the public, “change has taken place in connection with the Pentecostal Mission work in Hong Kong, China. Brother McIntosh and his co-workers have moved inland from Hong Kong, and have opened a work, which will be under the supervision of the denomination to which Brother McIntosh belongs.”⁶¹ Ironically, on the same note announcing McIntosh to move out of Hong Kong, the editor reposted a letter posted by Garr stating, “We are convinced that there is not a greater opening in any foreign field with better opportunities than Hong Kong affords.”⁶² What the editor of *The Way of Faith* has omitted was a kind of a complaint by Garr about McIntosh. It was due to McIntosh’s departure from Hong Kong that the mission Home had to be closed down. Garr wrote, “When we left Hong Kong to go to India, the missionaries were altogether in the Home, but Bro. McIntosh felt the Lord wanted him to move to Kowloon, and afterward he felt to [go to] the interior [of China], therefore, he had to give up the management of the Home in Hong Kong and Kowloon, and this, of course, has left the workers without a house, that is, those who are staying yet in Hong Kong.”⁶³ It seems that the disharmony between McIntosh and Mok has escalated. At the end, finally, the two parted, and Garr continued to work with Mok in Hong Kong as an Azusa Mission’s missionary and McIntosh would be supported by his Convention of Pentecostal Holiness Church of North Carolina and relocated to Sainam, working with “Mr. & Mrs. Kelly and baby, Miss Law, Mrs. Harrison and Golden.”⁶⁴ Yet the move to Sainam was a major event for the involved ministries, and, as expected, McIntosh did not stay there for long.

4.2. MCINTOSH LEAVES FOR JERUSALEM AND HIS FINAL RETURN TO THE USA

It seems that without any warning, a letter from McIntosh had been posted in the August 15, 1911 issue of *Bridegroom’s Messenger*. Letters from McIntosh in *Bridegroom’s Messenger* had become rare, yet it was more troubling that the letter was neither from Hong Kong nor from Sainam, but from Jerusalem. McIntosh wrote, “Greetings from far off Canaan’s shore. We arrived at Jerusalem two weeks ago.”⁶⁵ Unfortunately, the date of this letter was not given, and the estimate based on the time it took for McIntosh’s previous letter from Jerusalem in the 1908 to reach the printing of *Bridegroom’s Messenger*

⁵⁸ McIntosh, “McIntosh’s Appeal.”

⁵⁹ Jia Tian, *Yearbook of Chinese Local Records* (Beijing: Yearbook of Chinese Local Records Editing Office, 2008), 378/ 田嘉, 中国地方志年鉴 (北京: 中国地方志年鉴编辑部, 2008).

⁶⁰ Pentecostal Holiness Church of North Carolina, “Convention Register and Directory of Ordained Preachers for 1911” in *Proceedings of the Eleventh Annual Convention of the Pentecostal Holiness Church of North Carolina* (Goldsboro, NC: Nash Brothers, Printers and Binders, 1910), 15.

⁶¹ J. M. Pike, “Hong Kong China,” *The Way of Faith*, February 9, 1911, 8..

⁶² Pike, “Hong Kong China.”; A. G. Garr, “To the Saints of God Everywhere,” *Pentecostal Truths*, November 3, 1910, 4.

⁶³ Garr, “To the Saints.”

⁶⁴ Anna Maria Deane, “An Interesting Letter from Hong Kong, China,” *Bridegroom’s Messenger*, May 1, 1911, 4.

⁶⁵ T. J. McIntosh, “From Bro. T. J. McIntosh,” *Bridegroom’s Messenger*, August 15, 1911, 2.

took a little more than a month.⁶⁶ Therefore, McIntosh reached Jerusalem during his second mission trip around late June or early July of 1911. In this letter, McIntosh did not even once mention China, Hong Kong, or Sainam. He put his focus on the beggars that he saw on the street of Jerusalem, and he was praying and contemplating to take care of them. He expressed, “my heart went out to them.... And then came an impression that I should open a home here for these poor beggar Jews and feed them and clothe them and preach Jesus to them.”⁶⁷

It was during this time that a major event occurred in McIntosh’s family in Jerusalem. It was the birth of his son, T. J. McIntosh Jr. Although McIntosh did not mention this event in any letter, but Jr.’s name, place of birth was shown as Jerusalem, and with the date of birth as August 5th, 1911, appearing in a 1930 census report and on an obituary in a local newspaper of South Carolina.⁶⁸ If the lineup of dates are correct, Mrs. McIntosh got pregnant around late October of 1910, when McIntosh was in Hong Kong, thinking of the possibility to move his ministry to Sainam. If the estimated time for McIntosh to arrive in Jerusalem is correct, McIntosh was traveling from Sainam, China, to Jerusalem with Mrs. McIntosh in her sixth month pregnancy since the journey took around a month and a half at the time, and T. J. McIntosh Jr. was born after a few weeks upon their arrival in Jerusalem. It is difficult to imagine making such a long journey with a six-month pregnant wife, and a kindergarten daughter even in today’s travels by airplane or comfortable cruise liner. Yet, this arrangement was made in the early part of 1900s and the difficulties and discomfort could only be multiplied during this very journey made by the McIntoshs.

There was no known ministry or activities written about McIntosh’s second trip to Jerusalem other than his encounter with the local beggars, since his possible arrival in late June or early July of 1911. Again, for unknown reason, McIntosh and his family stayed in Jerusalem less than six months and then finally moved back to the USA. By November 21st, 1911, he was already participating in the three-day annual conference of the Pentecostal Holiness Church of North Carolina in Fayetteville. In this annual conference, McIntosh was portrayed as a ~~return~~ missionary returnee from Sainam, China.⁶⁹ In the December issue of the *Bridegroom’s Messenger*, the listing of McIntosh’s book was dropped without any known reason other than the possibility that it was out of print.⁷⁰ In the meantime, before the next Convention, the only document found related to McIntosh was a post made by him in the April 1, 1912 issue of the *Bridegroom’s Messenger* about his new address in Lynchburg, South Carolina.⁷¹

From November 19th to 21st of 1912, the thirteenth Annual Convention of the Pentecostal Holiness Church of North Carolina was held in the city of Durham, and McIntosh was one of the participants and his previous coworker in China, May Law, was recognized but not present at that time. Due to the death of a mission committee member, “Bro. T. J. McIntosh was elected to fill his place on the

⁶⁶ McIntosh, “Brother McIntosh in Jerusalem.” The letter is dated May 26, 1908.

⁶⁷ McIntosh, “From Bro. T. J. McIntosh.”

⁶⁸ U.S. Census Bureau, 1930 United States Census, s.v. “Thomas J. McIntosh.”; “Obituary of Thomas J. McIntosh Jr.,” *Charleston News and Courier*, June 7, 1990, 20.

⁶⁹ Pentecostal Holiness Church of North Carolina, Proceedings of the Twelfth Annual Convention of the Pentecostal Holiness Church of North Carolina (Goldsboro, NC: Nash Brothers, Printers and Binders, 1911), 6.

⁷⁰ “Some Good Tracts,” *Bridegroom’s Messenger*, December 1, 1911, 2.

⁷¹ T. J. McIntosh, “Brother T. J. McIntosh,” *Bridegroom’s Messenger*, April 1, 1912, 2.

committee on Missions.”⁷² His name was listed among J. H. King and S. D. Page to provide a report as committee.

4.3. MCINTOSH DROPPING FROM THE CONVENTION LIST

In the 1913 Convention, “On motion, the name of T. J. McIntosh is dropped from the roll, on the grounds of apostasy.”⁷³ Pronouncing someone as an apostate is a very strong accusation against a minister even in today’s standard. Yet in this Convention, name dropping from the Convention seem like a normal part of business proceeding every year. Three years before, in 1910, one of McIntosh’s supporters, G. B. Cashwell, was dropped from the list of membership of the Convention without any further explanation.⁷⁴ In the same year of McIntosh being dropped from the list, there were a total of six ministers dropped from the roll of preachers and the reasons given for dropping them were varied: from no ministerial work, leaked out and quit preaching, being named on another convention, unscriptural teaching, and on the ground of apostasy. By definition, “Apostasy is the total rejection of Christianity by a baptized person who, having at one time professed the Christian faith, publicly rejects it. It is distinguished from heresy, which is limited to the rejection of one or more Christian doctrines by one who maintains an overall adherence to Jesus Christ.”⁷⁵ Or by Catholic standards, “APOSTASY, in the strict, traditional sense of the word, is the gravely sinful act by which one totally abandons, inwardly and outwardly the Catholic faith in which he has been baptized and which he has heretofore professed.”⁷⁶ Therefore, the accusation of apostasy goes beyond mere teaching or believing a heresy, or like in the case of others, who have been dropped from the list due to unscriptural teaching. Basically, the Convention must have evidence(s) and/or witness(es) that McIntosh had claimed himself not to be a Christian anymore. There had been no explanation given for the mentioned motion to drop McIntosh from the preachers list of the Convention, nor had there been any names indicated of who might have carried the motion into that meeting. Even McIntosh’s preacher relatives were there in the meeting, his sister-in-law and her husband Mr. and Mrs. F. M. Britton were present.⁷⁷ Not a single word of defense or explanation had emerged or survived from the meeting. There could have been discussions over such a strong accusation put against McIntosh before the motion on the ground of apostasy was put forward, however, nothing had been recorded in the proceedings, nor in any other document available to the public so far.

5. MCINTOSH’S LATER LIFE

The story of McIntosh told by Daniel Woods in the presentation at the International Pentecostal Holiness Church Archives Luncheon, 24th General Conference in Cincinnati, Ohio, August 9, 2001 ended

⁷² Pentecostal Holiness Church of North Carolina, *Proceedings of the Thirteenth Annual Convention of the Holiness Church of North Carolina* (Durham: Nash Brothers, Printers and Binders, 1912), 5.

⁷³ Pentecostal Holiness Church of North Carolina, *Fourteenth Annual Convention*, 7.

⁷⁴ Pentecostal Holiness Church of North Carolina, “First Day--Afternoon Session” in *Proceedings of the Eleventh Annual Convention of the Pentecostal Holiness Church of North Carolina* (Goldsboro, NC: Nash Brothers, Printers and Binders, 1910), 15.

⁷⁵ Britannica, Editors of Encyclopaedia. “Apostasy.” *Encyclopedia Britannica*, December 26, 2017, accessed August 23, 2021, <https://www.britannica.com/topic/apostasy>.

⁷⁶ F. X. Lawlor, “Apostasy,” in *New Catholic Encyclopedia*, edited by The Catholic University of America (New York: McGraw-Hill, 1967), 679.

⁷⁷ Pentecostal Holiness Church of North Carolina, *Fourteenth Annual Convention*, 5.

with the “apostasy” note.⁷⁸ Most scholars would only tell the first half of the story about McIntosh being the first Pentecostal missionary who reached China and Woods already went beyond what most of the scholars have accomplished to tell. More than twenty years after Woods’ presentation, ~~there is~~ new evidence that reveals ~~more~~ about the account of McIntosh after he left the Convention.

At the time of McIntosh having been dropped by the Convention, he was only 34 years old. There has been no record found about him until World War I broke out and the USA was drafting men into the army. McIntosh filled out his registration card providing the address “604 Blossom St. Columbia, S.C.” and he presented as his occupation “collector”, employed by the “Carolina Life Ins. Co”, located in the same city where he lived.⁷⁹ The 1920 USA Census Report shows that McIntosh had moved to North Carolina, and he was working there as a “traveling salesman” and was living there together with his wife, teenage daughter Hazel and nine years old son, T. J. McIntosh Jr.⁸⁰ This change of career seems to be coherent with the apostasy outcome from the 1912 Convention.

After McIntosh’s name was dropped by the Convention, almost nothing had been written by or about him for almost ten years. The turning point seemed to have happened in 1921, the Convention’s newspaper, *The Pentecostal Holiness Advocate* had a series of articles providing the church history of the Convention of the Pentecostal Holiness Church of North Carolina. McIntosh’s name was addressed and honored as, “Rev. T. J. McIntosh, a preacher of The Holiness Church went to China in 1907, and traveled on around the world.”⁸¹ This was the first time ever that McIntosh appears in the Pentecostal church history after his name was removed from the convention. Three years later, George M. Kelley wrote a two and a half pages article beginning with an unnamed man who was the first Pentecostal missionary to go to China.⁸² Although the name was not mentioned by Kelley, respect and honor given to McIntosh filled the article in his words. In 1930, the local phone list of Charleston, South Carolina, showed both T. J. McIntosh and his son Junior on the list. While his son was listed, still living at the same address with McIntosh, the list referred to McIntosh as Reverend (Rev.), pastoring a Holiness Mission.⁸³ In the same year, the 1930 USA Census Report reflected that same data relating to McIntosh, stating his occupation as “Clergyman,” and serving in a “Holiness Mission.” Also, there were some interesting facts reflected in this Census Report, indicating that McIntosh’s household included his wife, son, daughter, and grandson. His daughter Hazel at the time had already been married to Paul D. Boone at the age of 23 and their son Paul D. Boone Jr. was at the age of three. Yet her husband Paul was not listed under the same household.⁸⁴ Clearly, McIntosh had returned back to be a minister at a church associated with the Holiness denomination, and was living together with his family, and he had already become a grandfather at the age of 50. In 1936, seemingly one of McIntosh’s friend had passed away and he served as one of the pall

⁷⁸ Woods, “Failure and Success.”

⁷⁹ State of South Carolina Local Board for the City of Columbia, “U.S., World War I Draft Registration Cards, 1917-1918,” Registration Card, Thomas James McIntosh, Serial Number 1685, Order Number 2581, September 12, 1918.

⁸⁰ U.S. Census Bureau, 1920 United States Census, s.v. “Thomas J. McIntosh.”

⁸¹ G. F. Taylor, “Our Church History. Chapter XI. Foreign Missions,” *The Pentecostal Holiness Advocate*, April 7, 1921, 8.

⁸² Kelley, “Great Door of Opportunity.”

⁸³ City of Charleston, *Walsh’s Charleston, S. C. City Directory 1930* (Charleston, South Carolina: House of Directories, 1930), 392.

⁸⁴ U.S. Census Bureau, 1930 United States Census, s.v. “Thomas J. McIntosh.”

bearers in Sumter County, South Carolina.⁸⁵ The 1940 USA Census Report shows that McIntosh had retired and was living solely with his wife Annie. They did not receive any wages but received more than \$50 from another source of income. Apparently, his daughter Hazel was living next door as the head of the household, without her husband, but with her son Paul, aged 13, and a daughter Betty at the age of 3 years.⁸⁶ In 1942, Mrs. McIntosh's sister Sarah, who was always referring to herself as Mrs. F. M. Britton, submitted a prayer for healing for Mrs. McIntosh, "who is suffering with pellagra,"⁸⁷ and the major cause of pellagra is malnutrition. No follow up document related to Annie's illness could be retrieved so far. In 1947, at the age of 68, McIntosh was invited by the Church of God in Greenville, South Carolina, to speak as an evangelist, which was announced in the following words: "Evangelist Thomas J. McIntosh will speak at the Church of God, 1502 Bramlett road, Sunday night. He will discuss 'The Riddle of Ezekiel.'" ⁸⁸ Clearly, McIntosh actively involved himself as a minister since the 1930s.

On February 5th, 1953, Thomas James McIntosh died at the DeKalb Kershaw County Hospital by natural causes. His obituary showed "preacher" as his general occupation, and he was buried within the DeKalb Baptist Cemetery, located in Kershaw, and the informant was his wife, Annie.⁸⁹ In June of 1953, McIntosh's sister-in-law, Sarah Britton, wrote a half page article in memoriam of T. J. McIntosh and provided some family details about the date of marriage and especially what happened to McIntosh in the last few years of his life. By the time of McIntosh's death, he was "survived by his widow, Mrs. Annie Edens McIntosh, one son, one daughter, three grandchildren and three great-grand-Children."⁹⁰ Sarah recalled how she first met with McIntosh and the details of her getting baptized by the Holy Spirit. She also summarized McIntosh's missionary work in China and referred to a letter from Brother Sung honoring McIntosh's ministries. She affirmed that McIntosh had indeed retired as a preacher of the Church of God and continued to be a follower of Christ until his death.⁹¹ Five years after McIntosh's death, Annie McIntosh passed away,⁹² and her name showed up on an obituary section of the *South Carolina, Evening Post*, April 24, 1958, living in 100 Beaufain St. Charleston, SC, widow of Thomas James McIntosh. In regard to McIntosh's children, Hazel Boone passed away in 1981,⁹³ and Thomas J. McIntosh Jr. died in 1990.⁹⁴ Most of them continued to live in South Carolina during their lifetime.

CONCLUSION

In conclusion, McIntosh's life and ministries have been laid out chronologically. From his early life to his death, McIntosh had followed the voice within him which he believed to be from the Holy

⁸⁵ "Paul B. Hodge," *The Sumter Daily*, November 25, 1936, 4.

⁸⁶ U.S. Census Bureau, 1940 United States Census, s.v. "Thomas J. McIntosh."

⁸⁷ Mrs. F. M. Britton, "Requests," *The Pentecostal Holiness Advocate*, November 5, 1942, 12.

⁸⁸ "Evangelist to Speak," *The Greenville News*, June 20, 1947, 16.

⁸⁹ State of South Carolina State Board of Health, Standard Certificate of Death 53002014, Thomas James McIntosh, February 5, 1953.

⁹⁰ Britton, "In Memoriam," 14.

⁹¹ Britton, "In Memoriam," 14.

⁹² State of South Carolina State Board of Health, Standard Certificate of Death 58004935, Annie Elizabeth McIntosh, April 24, 1958.

⁹³ "Obituary of Hazel Lois Boone," *Evening Post*, October 11, 1981.

⁹⁴ "Obituary of Thomas J. McIntosh Jr."

Spirit. He bravely voyaged around the world twice with his family, without any solid financial support, which some would call some kind of acts of ignorance. He pioneered his way to Macau and to Sainam for latter Pentecostal missionaries and initiated and helped to lay the foundation of the first Chinese Pentecostal newspaper, *The Pentecostal Truth*, in Hong Kong. Although as the first Pentecostal missionary to China, he did not stay in China long enough to see the fruit of his work. Yet his efforts and impact had been taken up and continued by both other missionaries and local Chinese believers. Although the first Protestant Pentecostal missionary to China, T. J. McIntosh's reputation and publicity is incomparable with the first Protestant missionary to China, Robert Morrison, as Fannie Winn put it in her own testimony over 100 years ago and it is still holding its resonance, "Eternity alone will fully reveal what the coming of Brother and Sister McIntosh to China has meant."⁹⁵

⁹⁵ Winn, "How God Has Blessed."